

## Adagio ma non troppo

4 **Recitativo** **più adagio** **Andante**

(a) *ped.* \*

5 **Adagio** (b) *rit.* *cantabile* (d)

*tutte le corde* *dim.* *una corda*

*sempre tenuto* *ped.* (c)

- (a) The first edition shows a pedal release on the RH A-flat eighth note midway in measure 4. The complete autograph (used as a source in this edition thus far) shows no point of release. A second autograph of this work also exists from the *Adagio ma non troppo* to the end of the work. This second autograph is in the archives of the Beethoven-Haus in Bonn and is believed to have been prepared by the composer as a template for indicating editorial changes for Schlesinger's Berlin publication (see page 204 for details). This Bonn autograph shows the pedal release at the harmonic resolution just before the *Andante*, as shown in the above text. Of the referenced editors, eight follow the first edition, using the shorter pedal. Martiensen, Schenker, Schnabel, Taylor, Wallner, and this editor show the longer pedal.
- (b) The execution of the repeated notes in measure 5 is disputed. Beethoven's fingering over the first two RH sixteenth notes (shown here in italics) suggests the composer had something specific in mind. (Other instances of this direction are at measure 125 of this movement and in the third movement of the Op. 106 at measure 165.) Of the referenced editors who comment on this figure, Schnabel and Taylor believe the second note of the tied pairs should be played as softly as possible (the third note in instances where three notes are tied). Bülow also implies this execution; and although Tovey mentions it, his position with regard to execution seems unclear. D'Albert and Casella rewrite the rhythmic notation of the passage, Casella suggesting playing the second of the tied notes on pianos that "cooperate." A controversy rages over whether or not Beethoven was imitating *bebung*, a vibrato effect possible on the clavichord by repressing the key and moving the metal tangent against the string. Bülow and Taylor liken the effect to *bebung*, while Tovey scoffs at the comparison. Trying to decide if the composer was imitating *bebung* does not in itself solve the issue of whether or not to play the second note of each of the tied pairs, a matter each performer will have to answer individually. A second but related issue is the arrangement of the ties attending the RH dotted sixteenth note (the fifth sixteenth note in the measure, not counting the grace note). The above text, adopted by nine of the referenced editors, represents the version shown by the Bonn autograph (see footnote (a)). None of the referenced editors use the following version from the complete autograph:



The first edition shows the following:



Krebs, Schenker, and Tovey follow the first edition. Bülow rewrites the passage, adding an extra sixteenth note.



17

1 2-1 2 3-5 1 1 3-4

*cresc.*

20

3 4 3 1 2 4 1 2 3 1

23

4 2 3 1 4 4

*dim.* *pp*

Fuga 27

*Allegro ma non troppo*

*p* *sempre p*

33

5 3 4 3 2-1

*p<sub>3</sub>*

© In the first edition, the A-flat is missing from the last two LH chords of measure 19. It is shown in both autographs. Of the referenced editors, only d'Albert, Krebs, and Martienssen follow the first edition.

Ⓣ As at the end of the second movement, the pedal indication in measure 25 is in all early sources, but there is no indication of release. Five of the referenced editors add a release sign before the onset of the fugue. Taylor recommends a release on the first note of the fugue. Casella shows shorter pedals, presumably to insure that the sixteenth rests are observed. Tovey suggests that half-pedaling can produce an effect that acknowledges the rests. A second issue is that the first edition shows the last note of measure 25 to be a sixteenth note (in both hands) followed by two sixteenth rests. Both autographs show eighth-note values, as in the above text. Six of the referenced editors follow the first edition, seven follow the autographs.